

Boulevard Planning Group  
**MINUTES/SUMMARY, DECEMBER 2, 2010**  
Boulevard Fire and Rescue Inc. Training Room, 39919 Highway 94/Ribbonwood

**1) CALL TO ORDER at 7:00 PM.**

**2) DETERMINATION OF QUORUM/ROLL CALL:** Members present: Tammy Daubach, Audra Hall, Jeffrey McKernan, Chris Noland, Patricia Stuart, Donna Tisdale (Chair). Excused Absence: Cheryl Lenz

**3) APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** M/S McKernan/Noland to approve the November 4, 2010 minutes. Passed: 5-0-1. (Stuart abstained due to absence at the November meeting.)

**4) CORRESPONDENCE:** No correspondence other than agenda items.

**5) NEW BUSINESS:**

**A. VERIZON WIRELESS MUP MODIFICATION TO ADD 4 MICROWAVE DISHES TO WHITE STAR FACILITY: P-90-019W4:** Carla Gresham was present for the applicant and answered questions on the proposed upgrade to add two 4' and two 6' microwave dishes to the existing wireless facility at 1676 Tierra Real Road, Boulevard. A Cal Fire Battalion Chief brought in an OSHA IIPP8 form filed anonymously by a White Star fire fighter. The Description of Unsafe Condition or Practice complaint included the following statement: *"With the new construction of Microwave towers next to White Star Station. I have concerns of the added Radio Frequency Radiation and Electromotive Force."* Employee's suggestion for improving safety stated: *"Testing to ensure that Radio Frequency Radiation and Electromotive force would not affect FF Safety."* The Chief further stated that there are concerns with cumulative impacts with the existing and increasing numbers of wireless facilities and microwave dishes, including the new SDG&E monopole and microwave dish recently installed as part of the Sunrise Powerlink project, approximately 75' from the firefighters barracks. Direction of microwave dishes also a concern. After hearing concerns, Ms. Gresham asked that they be placed in writing and provided to the County. At the same time, there were requests to look into gaps in coverage in the Boulevard area.

**M/S: Tisdale/Hall: Request the County to direct Verizon to conduct Radio Frequency Radiation and Electromotive Force (EMF) testing at White Star Fire Station. Passed 6-0-0**

**B. POTENTIAL APPEAL TO PLANNING COMMISSION OF ZONING ADMINISTRATOR'S NOV 16 APPROVAL OF BRUCCI (SCOTT PACK) MET TOWER (WIND TESTING) PERMIT APPLICATION CASE #300-10-023:** George Coladonato did not attend the meeting. The Planning Group reviewed and discussed an appeal, based on the appeal filed by BAD, POC, and ECCAC, to revoke the administrative permit 10-023 for cause under 7074 (*"That the use for which the permit was granted is so conducted as to be detrimental to the public health, welfare, safety, or as to be a nuisance." as so identified in the attached real estate impact evaluation from McCann Appraisal, LLC*) and request a county-wide moratorium on MET facility permitting and installation until the Wind Energy Ordinance amendments EIR is completed and adopted. The McCann evaluation showed a potential loss in property value up to 34%.

**M/S Noland/Stuart that the Planning Group adopt the Nov 29th Appeal to the Planning Commission filed by BAD, POC, ECCAC, in its entirety, including attachments and (3) formal requests for an appeal hearing, revocation of the permit for cause, and for a moratorium on MET towers until the Wind Energy Ordinance Amendments EIR is completed and adopted. Passed 6-0-0**

**C. EGP JEWEL VALLEY LLC METEROLOGICL (MET) FACILITY ADMINISTRATIVE**

**PERMIT APPLICATION: AD10-051:** Planner Stuart recused herself due to a determination by the County that her property was within 500 feet of the Enel Project footprint representing a conflict-of-interest. Presentations were given for applications AD10-051, AD10-052, and AD10-053 by Jennifer Purczynski, Senior Manager of Project Development, Chris Wahl of Southwest Strategies, and Project Design Consultant, Joan Heredia (formerly with Sempra). Purczynski stated that Enel works in 6 countries and has 5,700 MW of generation. Enel bought out Padoma, a La Jolla based company. They go to schools to educate students on green power. In response to a direct question, she responded that Enel had not purchased the Lansing properties but they are negotiating an option. The Chair reported that she and planner Noland had met with Enel reps, at their request, prior to planning group meeting. Chair also reported that she informed Enel reps that her extensive research over the last few years, and participation at the International Symposium on the Adverse Health Effects from Wind Turbines in Ontario, led her to believe that the location of their project would put an end to residential development due to the need to have setbacks of at least 1.25 to 2 miles to prevent adverse health effects caused by infrasonic vibrations and low frequency noise levels. She reported that some homeowners have been bought out by wind companies while others have been forced to abandon their homes and farms to escape the intolerable effects that make some people and animals very ill. A large group of community members raised concerns and asked questions. Some reported impacts from existing turbines including noise, views, and red night lighting. Most comments related to concerns about the loss of property values and quality of life, loss of premium views of Jewel Valley and McCain Valley, destruction of rural community character, impacts to public health and safety, and loss of tourism and the money that goes with it. Planner Hall asked about Enel turbine collapse in Fenner New York. The response was that there was an on-going investigation. The Chair raised issues with noise from proposed SoDar Units that had been heard several hundred feet away at another location by a man who was hard of hearing. Ms. Purczynski admitted she had not toured the project area and accepted an invitation from Planner Hall to do so.

**M/S McKernan/Noland that the Planning Group oppose the permit applications and request a public hearing and noise testing on the soDar units. Passed 5-0-1.** Planner Stuart recused.

**D. EGP JEWEL VALLEY LLC MET FACILITY ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION:**

**AD10-052:** Multiple Enel applications were discussed jointly but acted on separately.

**M/S Daubach/McKernan that the Planning Group oppose the permit applications and request a public hearing and noise testing on the soDar units. Passed 5-0-1.** Planner Stuart recused.

**E. EGP JEWEL VALLEY LLC MET FACILITY ADMINISTRATIVE PERMIT APPLICATION:**

**AD10-053:** Multiple Enel applications were discussed jointly but acted on separately.

**M/S McKernan/Hall that the Planning Group oppose the permit applications and request a public hearing and noise testing on the soDar units. Passed 5-0-1.** Planner Stuart recused.

**F. REQUEST TO COUNTY TO GENERATE ONE CUMULATIVE IMPACT MAP FOR EAST COUNTY WIND , SOLAR AND TRANSMISSION PROJECTS:**

**M/S Tisdale/Noland that the Planning Group request the County generate one map showing all the projects/ applications for wind, solar, and transmission cumulative impacts on federal, county, and private lands. Passed 6-0-0.**

**6.UPDATES AND POTENTIAL ACTION ITEMS:**

**A. TULE WIND, ECO SUBSTATION, ENERGIA SIERRA JUAREZ:** ( Item taken out of order) SDG&E's Cameron Durckel stated that the Environmental Impact Report should be released for public comment on December 24<sup>th</sup> or 30<sup>th</sup>. There will be a 45 day public comment period. There will be two local public meetings. It was also stated that BLM and FWS have agreed to Golden Eagle mitigation. In

contradiction to Durckel's statement, the Chair responded that the Sunrise Powerlink is considered a Connected Action even though it is not directly connected into the Eco Substation.

**B. GENERAL PLAN UPDATE:** The third hearing will be on December 8<sup>th</sup> at 9:00 AM. Staff informed the Chair that they will likely need to go through the requests of over 200 speakers for changes related to their properties and then bring it back to the planning groups, planning commission and BOS.

**C. SUNRISE POWERLINK & BOULEVARD COMMUNITY COUNCIL:** The Federal lawsuit has not been dismissed. There are several lawsuits still on the way.

**D. DOE'S DRAFT EIS FOR SEMPRA'S PRESIDENTIAL PERMIT APPLICATION FOR A 500 KV CROSS BORDER POWER LINE FOR THEIR 1,250 MW ENERGIA SIERRA JUAREZ WIND ENERGY PROJECT:** Unconfirmed information indicates that the Final EIS / ROD will be out in April with a 15-day comment period.

**E. ROUGH ACRES RANCH SUNRISE POWERLINK CONSTRUCTION YARD PHASE 1 WAS APPROVED BY PUC ON SEPT 28:** Groundbreaking will be on December 9<sup>th</sup> at 10:30 AM. There will be a sky crane helicopter demonstration. There are 300 invitees including the Governor. A rally, a press conference, and peaceful protest have been planned for 9:00 AM on McCain Valley Road. An east to west road, off of Ribbonwood Rd, is in proposed to connect to McCain Valley Road.

**F. BOULEVARD REVITALIZATION REPORT:** A representative of the Revitalization Committee will be attending the December 3<sup>rd</sup> Backcountry Revitalization Steering Committee meeting with Supervisor Dianne Jacob at 2:30 PM at the Mountain Empire Community Center. The community feels that the County should enforce that Tacos Mexico be stabilized by the property owner, Tom Hom.

**7. PRESENTATION FROM THE FLOOR ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS: 1)** *(taken out of order at beginning of meeting at SDG&E's request)* SDG&E's Todd Voorhees said he came to answer questions submitted to him by the Planning Group, but he could not answer how many mature Oaks / trees will be removed for the Sunrise Powerlink, including along Cameron Truck Trail where many are marked for removal. He promised to get back to us. When asked if the significant number of double-trailer trucks, believed to be Hansen trucks, entering and exiting McCain Valley Road, and making unsafe traffic merges, were working on Sunrise prior to the Notice To Proceed for the area, Voorhees said he did not think they were related, but he would check. The Notice To Proceed was issued for 6.2 miles of Alpine Blvd. Work starts next week through June 2010. CPUC approved 500 trips a day on their traffic study for I-8, Ribbonwood Rd, Old Highway 80, and McCain Valley Road. He stated the report found no significant impacts. Safety signs will be posted on McCain Valley Road. He admitted that no cumulative projects were addressed for traffic study. The types of lights for the towers have not been decided by FFA but PMR proposed infrared. As for water issues, the water will be brought in from City San Diego, Heber in Imperial Valley, and the Padre Dam. Mitigation for this area includes 6,000 acres of land bought in Imperial County for the bighorn sheep. In the future, all wood poles will be replaced with steel electricity poles. Voorhees could not answer how many poles had already been swapped in Boulevard and why they started at Rough Acres Ranch Sunrise Construction Yard and through the area planned for Enel's Jewel Valley wind project, and what appeared to be part of the ECO Substation 138 kV route.

Comments from the board and members of the public challenged SDG&E's statements including the mitigation for local bighorn sheep taking place in a distant area that will not help local bighorns impacted

by Sunrise, Tule Wind and other cumulative projects. Two residents, retired from CHP and DPW, asked questions about laden truck weight and challenged the reported lack of impacts to local roads. Allegations were also made that funding for local roads had been inappropriately diverted to other areas.

2) A community member stated that the new Border Patrol building will be two stories high. Concerns were raised that this was new information that was not previously disclosed. He stated that Agent Henderson will show anyone who asks the plans. It is Border Patrol policy not to volunteer information if specific questions are not asked.

**8) ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting was adjourned at 9:30 pm. Minutes are submitted by Tammy Daubach, Secretary.

For more information, contact  
Donna Tisdale, Chair, 619-766-4170  
[donnatisdale@hughes.net](mailto:donnatisdale@hughes.net)  
P. O. Box 1272, Boulevard, CA 91905